

The disinfecting effect of glutaraldehyde and peracetic acid on tensile load at failure of orthodontic elastomeric chains

Mohammad Saleh Barati¹, Reza Ghorbanipour², Ebrahim Zabihi³, Manouchehr Rahmati Kamel²,
Omid Teymournejad⁴, Mohammad Hadi Pashaei⁵, Valiollah Arash⁶✉

1. Postgraduate Student, Student Research Committee, Babol University of Medical Sciences, Babol, IR Iran.
2. Assistant Professor, Dental Materials Research Center, Health Research Institute, Babol University of Medical Sciences, Babol, IR Iran.
3. Associate Professor, Cellular and Molecular Biology Research Center, Health Research Institute, Babol University of Medical Sciences, Babol, IR Iran.
4. Postdoctoral Researcher, Center for Microbial Pathogenesis, Abigail Wexner Research Institute at Nationwide Children's Hospital, The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio, USA.
5. Associate Professor, Faculty of Mechanical Engineering, Babol Noshirvani University of Technology, Babol, IR Iran.
6. Associate Professor, Dental Materials Research Center, Health Research Institute, Babol University of Medical Sciences, Babol, IR Iran.

✉**Corresponding Author:** Valiollah Arash, Department of Orthodontics, Faculty of Dentistry, Babol University of Medical Sciences, Babol, IR Iran.

Email: v.arash@mubabol.ac.ir

Tel: +981132291408

ORCID (0000-0002-0459-3064)

Received: 25 Jul 2020

Accepted: 6 Mar 2021

Abstract

Introduction: The purpose of this study was to compare the effect of peracetic acid with glutaraldehyde on tensile load at failure of elastomeric chains after disinfection.

Materials & Methods: Tensile load and extension to failure in 30 elastomeric chains were allocated in three groups was measured using Universal Testing Machine. The results were analyzed using ANOVA and Tukey's post hoc test with a significant level at $p < 0.05$.

Results: Glutaraldehyde and peracetic acid decreased the tensile load and elongation to failure of elastomeric chains compared to the control ($P = 0.03$ for tensile load and $P = 0.01$ for extension to failure). There were no significant differences between these two disinfectants ($P = 0.07$ for tensile load and $P = 0.09$ for extension to failure).

Conclusion: There tensile load and elongation to failure in chains decreased in both glutaraldehyde and peracetic acid, which is not clinically significant.

Keywords: Disinfection, Orthodontics, Peracetic acid, Glutaraldehyde

Citation for article: Barati MS, Ghorbanipour R, Zabihi E, Rahmati Kamel M, Teymournejad O, Pashaei MH, et al. The disinfecting effect of glutaraldehyde and peracetic acid on tensile load at failure of orthodontic elastomeric chains. Caspian J Dent Res 2021; 10: 64-8.

اثر ضد عفونی گلوئارالدهید و اسید پراستیک بر نیروی کشش در زمان شکست زنجیرهای الاستومریک ارتودنسی

محمد صالح براتی^۱، رضا قربانی پور^۲، ابراهیم ذبیحی^۳، منوچهر رحمتی کامل^۴، امید تیمورنژاد^۴، محمد هادی پاشایی^۵، ولی اله آرش^{۶*}

۱. دانشجوی دستیاری، مرکز تحقیقات دانشجویی، پژوهشکده سلامت، دانشگاه علوم پزشکی بابل، بابل، ایران.

۲. استادیار، مرکز تحقیقات مواد دندان، پژوهشکده سلامت، دانشگاه علوم پزشکی بابل، بابل، ایران.

۳. دانشیار، مرکز تحقیقات سلولی و بیولوژی مولکولی، پژوهشکده سلامت، دانشگاه علوم پزشکی بابل، بابل، ایران.

۴. محقق فوق دکتر، مرکز پاثوژن میکروبی، انستیتوی تحقیقات ایگل و کسنریمارستان کودکان سراسری، دانشگاه ایالتی اوهایو، کلمبوس، اوهایو، ایالات متحده آمریکا.

۵. دانشیار، دانشکده مهندسی مکانیک، دانشگاه صنعتی نوشیروانی بابل، بابل، ایران.

۶. دانشیار، مرکز تحقیقات مواد دندان، پژوهشکده سلامت، دانشگاه علوم پزشکی بابل، بابل، ایران.

*نویسنده مسئول: ولی اله آرش، گروه ارتودنسی، دانشکده دندانپزشکی، دانشگاه علوم پزشکی بابل، بابل، ایران.

پست الکترونیکی: v.arash@mubabol.ac.ir تلفن: ۹۸۱۱۳۲۹۱۴۰۸

چکیده

مقدمه: هدف این مطالعه مقایسه اثر اسید پراستیک با گلوئارالدهید بر نیروی کشش و شکست زنجیرهای الاستومریک بعد از ضد عفونی با آنها می باشد.

مواد و روش ها: نیروی کشش و مقدار کشیدگی زمان شکست در ۳۰ عدد زنجیر الاستومریک در سه گروه مطالعه با استفاده از دستگاه آزمایش یونیورسال اندازه گیری شد. نتایج با تست ANOVA و Tukey آنالیز شده و سطح آماری معنی دار $p < 0.05$ بود.

یافته ها: گلوئارالدهید و اسید پراستیک نیروی کشش و مقدار کشیدگی زمان شکست را کاهش دادند ($p=0.03$) نیروی کشش ($p=0.07$) و مقدار کشیدگی ($p=0.09$) زمان شکست تفاوت آماری معنی دار بین دو گروه ضد عفونی کننده وجود نداشت.

نتیجه گیری: نیروی کشش و مقدار کشیدگی زمان شکست زنجیرهای الاستومریک در هر دو ماده ضد عفونی کننده گلوئارالدهید و اسید پراستیک کاهش یافت که این مقدار کاهش از لحاظ کلینیکی حائز اهمیت نمی باشد.

واژگان کلیدی: ضد عفونی کردن، ارتودنسی، اسید پراستیک، گلوئارالدهید

Introduction

Nowadays, orthodontic springs and elastomeric products are very commonly used because of their high efficiency and relatively low prices. Since orthodontic elastomers might be contaminated with different germs during production process, extensive exposure to disinfectants is inevitable to prevent localization of microorganism infection in oral cavity.^[1,2] Chemical interaction of these disinfectants with elastomeric chains and consequent adverse effects on their physical properties has been the major concern in previous investigations. In some studies conducted on glutaraldehyde 2% with different times of exposure, the elastomeric chains have shown no significant decrease in tensile strength until 30 minutes after exposure (disinfection process); however, by further increase in

the exposure time (sterilization process), their strength has significantly decreased.^[3]

Peracetic acid has been preferred by some investigators as a new disinfectant because of quicker degradation and minimal leftover residues. In contrary to glutaraldehyde, peracetic is self-degradable, nontoxic and nonteratogen. It has been shown that sterilization by autoclave might adversely affect the mechanical characteristics of elastomers and latex elastics compared to chemical disinfection e.g. glutaraldehyde which saves the elastics' strength.^[4,5] In health care guidelines, peracetic acid 0.2% would be used to reduce infection rate in hospital.^[6] The elastomeric chains are not heat resistant and generally sterilized via cold sterilization. Some studies indicated that disinfection of a elastic can destroy of the cross links available in the

long chain molecules of polyurethane polyesters. [7] In a study, tensile strength and glass transformation temperature of elastomeric ligatures not disinfected are found significantly different from those exposed to phenol and glutaraldehyde. [2] In another study conducted by Losito et al. (2014), it was reported that there was no significant difference between chlorhexidine 0.12 and peracetic acid 0.2% on mechanical properties of elastomeric chains and they could be clinically used up to 28 days. [8]

Since orthodontic elastomers might be contaminated with different germs, the purpose of current study was to compare the effect of disinfection by glutaraldehyde 2% and peracetic acid 0.25% on tensile load and elongation to failure of elastomeric chains.

Materials & Methods

This study was approved by the Ethics Committee of Babol University of Medical Sciences, Babol, Iran (with the code of MUBABOL.REC.1395.69). In this in vitro study, according to the previous study, [9] 30 elastomeric chains without space obtained from Orthotechnology (Orthotechnology inc., West Columbia, US) were divided into three groups: 10 cases as control without

disinfection soaked in sterile normal saline, 10 cases disinfected with glutaraldehyde 2% (Behsa Pharmaceutical Co., Tehran, Iran) for 30 minutes [3] and 10 cases disinfected with peracetic acid 0.25% (BehBan Pharmed Lotus company, Tehran, Iran) for 30 minutes. [8] All chains were irrigated with distilled water for 1 minute. Each chain was inserted between metallic pins of Universal Testing Machine (Koopaa, Iran) and fixed with acrylic glue (Bison International B.V., Rotterdam, The Netherlands). The length of all chains was fixed at 12 mm. Each chain was elongated at speed of 20 mm per minute until rupture occurred. [9] At rupture point, the tensile load in Newton (N) and extension to failure in millimeters (mm) were recorded. All data were analyzed by SPSS 17 using one-way ANOVA test and Tukey comparison test with a 95% significant level.

Results

The mean of tensile load at failure and extension to failure are presented in table 1.

Table 1. The mean and standard deviation of tensile load at failure and extension to failure in groups of study

Disinfectant	Glutaraldehyde 2%	Peracetic acid 0.25%	Control	P value
	Mean±SD	Mean±SD	Mean±SD	According to ANOVA
Tensile load at failure (N)	38.7±4.5	38.1±3.5	42.85±4	P=0.01
Extension to failure (mm)	38.3±0.45	37.9±0.55	45±0.35	P=0.001

(N =Newton) (mm = millimeter)

According to statistical test of ANOVA for both the tensile load at failure and extension to failure, there was a significant difference between study groups (P=0.03 for tensile load at failure and P=0.01 for extension to failure). The Tukey's Post hoc test demonstrated that there were no significant differences between glutaraldehyde and peracetic acid groups neither in tensile load at failure nor in extension to failure (P=0.07 for tensile load at failure and P=0.09 for extension to failure). However, compared to the control group, there was significant decrease in the tensile load at failure and in the extension to failure of both disinfectant groups (P=0.03 for tensile load at failure and P=0.01 for extension to failure).

Discussion

Disinfection with peracetic acid and glutaraldehyde in this study decreased the tensile load at failure of elastomeric chains in comparison to control group. Macedo et al. (2015) has already displayed that the high temperature changes characteristics of elastomers, and the sterilization with autoclave decreases the strength of elastomeric chains. [4] In addition, it was found that the chemical disinfection with hypochlorite sodium 1% and glutaraldehyde 2% decreased the strength of chains which was in accordance to our study. [5] Because of acidic pH, glutaraldehyde had less effect on the strength of chains compared to hypochlorite sodium with basic Ph. [3]

Evangelista et al. (2007) evaluated the strength of ligature elastomers from American Orthodontics® (AO), 3M® and Rocky Mountain® (RMO) in glutaraldehyde 3.4% and Vital Defense®-D composed of 9% o-phenylphenol and 1% o-benzyl-p-chlorophenol [Vital Defense Company, Denver, Canada] at different times. They claimed that disinfectants could significantly decrease the tensile load at failure of elastomeric chains which is in complete agreement with our present study results. At that experiment, after 8 hours immersion in disinfectants, the strength of chains reached to a plateau form and was compared to their original tensile load (79% for AO, 86% for 3M and 70% for RMO). The researchers have stated that this decrease is not clinically significant since only 10-20% of tensile load at failure is enough for clinical use.^[2]

Singh (2016) evaluated the effect of disinfection by glutaraldehyde at two concentrations of 2% (Glutarex®) and 1.5% (Cidex®) on elastomeric chains made by five different companies. Before 0.5 hour, the tensile load at failure of elastomeric chains for all brands decreased significantly except for one brand, indicating the reduction in tensile load of failure decreased after 0.5 hour. This different result in brands might be owing to different primary materials and production processes.^[1] The results of our study are in concordance with those of Singh's investigation ones.

Losito et al. (2014) declared that disinfection with chlorhexidine 0.2% for 10 minutes and peracetic acid 0.2% for 30 minutes declined the tensile load at failure of chains in a constant elongation.^[8] Their results are in agreement with those of the ongoing study, too. They found that chains after 28 days had significant decrease in load and were ineffective in clinical use so they should be replaced.

Python et al. (2015) investigated the effects of different sterilization/disinfection methods (70°C GL alcohol, autoclave, ultraviolet, peracetic acid and glutaraldehyde) on the mechanical properties of orthodontic elastomeric chains. Ultraviolet treatment was not completely effective for sterilization. No loss of mechanical properties occurred through using different sterilization methods, which is similar to that of our study.^[10] The limitation of this study was that only two disinfectants were compared and it is proposed to compare different cold sterilization materials and heat sterilization with each other in future studies. Although the tensile load at failure decreases significantly with both disinfectants (since only 150-200 gram force is

needed in the clinical use (about 10-15% of tensile load at failure), this reduction is not clinically important and both these two disinfectants can be used clinically. Nevertheless, according to other study in which the force decreased after 4 weeks^[8], the elastomeric chains should be replaced monthly.

Conclusion

There was less tensile load at failure and elongation to failure in chains immersed in glutaraldehyde and peracetic acid, which is not clinically important. This finding might justify the use of newly introduced disinfectant, peracetic acid, in orthodontic procedures if it could show advantages in other aspects.

Funding: This study was a part of research project (Grant no: 9542126), supported and funded by Babol University of Medical Sciences

Conflict of interest disclosure: The authors state that they have no conflict of interest.

Author's Contribution

The study was designed by Valiollah Arash and Manouchehr Rahmati Kamel. Mohammad Saleh Barati and Ebrahim Zabihi defined the conceptual content of the research. The study data were collected by Mohammad Saleh Barati and Omid Teymournejad and Mohammad Hadi Pashaei. Statistical analysis and interpretation of data were accomplished by Reza Ghorbanipour. The manuscript was prepared by Reza Ghorbanipour and revised by Ebrahim Zabihi contributed to the design and implementation of the research. Study supervision was performed by Valiollah Arash Manouchehr Rahmati Kamel.

References

1. Singh M. Effect on Mechanical Properties of Orthodontic Elastomeric Ligatures on Immersion in Disinfecting Solutions - an in vitro Study. *British J Med Med Res* 2016;18: 1-9.
2. Evangelista MB, Berzins DW, Monaghan P. Effect of Disinfecting Solutions on the Mechanical Properties of Orthodontic Elastomeric Ligatures. *Angle Orthod* 2007; 77: 681-7.
3. Jeffries CL, von Fraunhofer JA. The effects of 2% alkaline glutaraldehyde solution on the elastic

- properties of elastomeric chain. Angle Orthod 1991; 61: 25-30.
4. Macêdo EOD, Ottonelli Stopiglia CD, Fortes CBB, Samuel SMW, Scroferneker ML. Influence of different disinfection processes on intra-arch latex elastic. Revista Odonto Ciencia 2015; 30: 35-8.
 5. Paige SZ, Tran AM, English JD, Powers JM. The effect of temperature on latex and non-latex orthodontic elastics. Tex Dent J 2008; 125:244-9.
 6. Usefi M, Zandi H, Jambarsang S, Mokhtari M, Noori Shadkami M. Evaluating the Effects of Peracetic Acid and Chlorine Dioxide Disinfectants on Staphylococcus Aureus Isolated from surfaces of NICU. J Environ Health Sustain Dev 2019; 4: 791-7.
 7. Jankare S, Surani SS, Parchake P, Borkar E, Rathod A. Sterilization Protocol in Orthodontic Practice: A Review. Acta Sci Dent Sci 2019; 3: 32-9.
 8. Losito KAB, Lucato AS, Tubel CAM, Correa CA, Santos JC. Force decay in orthodontic elastomeric chains after immersion in disinfection solutions. Braz J Oral Sci 2014; 13:266-9.
 9. Kumar K, Shetty S, Krithika MJ, Cyriac B. Effect of Commonly Used Beverage, soft drink, and mouthwash on force delivered by elastomeric chain: a comparative In vitro study. J Int Oral Health 2014; 6: 7-10.
 10. Pithon MM, Ferraz CS, Rosa FC, Rosa LP. Sterilizing elastomeric chains without losing mechanical properties. Is it possible? Dental Press J Orthod 2015; 20:96-100.